



## Digital Transformation in Educational Human Resource Management: A Study of HRIS System Implementation

Yancis

Institut Agama Islam Al-Amanah Jeneponto, Indonesia

Corresponding Author  [yancissikki@gmail.com](mailto:yancissikki@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

The application of information technology in human resource management has become a strategic necessity in the education sector. This study aims to in-depth assess the readiness of educational institutions to adopt Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) and analyze the factors influencing their successful implementation. The study employed a qualitative approach with a systematic literature review of scientific publications from the past ten years. Content analysis was used to identify themes, patterns, and relationships between relevant concepts. The study's findings indicate that successful HRIS implementation is influenced by top management support, staff digital competence, technological infrastructure readiness, and the effectiveness of training and an organizational culture that supports change. HRIS has been shown to improve administrative efficiency, decision-making quality, personnel data accuracy, and transparency in HR management. The study also highlights the role of transformational leadership and the importance of change management strategies in overcoming organizational resistance. The implications of this study indicate that effective HRIS implementation requires a holistic approach encompassing technical, structural, and cultural aspects. These findings provide an important contribution to the development of technology-based HR management policies and practices in the education sector.

### ARTICLE INFO

*Article history:*

Received

May 20, 2025

Revised

July 25, 2025

Accepted

September 26,  
2025

**Keywords:** *Human Resource Information Systems; Human Resource Management; Educational Institutions; Digital Transformation; Transformational Leadership*

Journal Homepage

<https://ojs.staialfurqan.ac.id/IJoASER/>

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

## INTRODUCTION

The digital transformation over the past five years has had a significant impact on human resource management (HR) in the education sector. These changes have not only affected teaching and administration, but also the interaction patterns between teachers, students, and parents, which have overall strengthened the quality of educational services. Hasrianti and Hidayati (2023) observed how teachers at a private high school in Kendari City faced digital challenges by improving their educational technology skills. Similarly, Abroor and Mulyati (2024) demonstrated that the implementation of a web-based information system has facilitated the administration and management of learning activities more efficiently.

In this context, human resource management takes center stage. Hakim (2023) emphasized that educational organizations must adopt a modern human resource management approach to address digital challenges. Staff training and competency development are key to optimizing the use of digital technology (Rusiyati et al., 2023). According to Zulfa et al. (2024), digital transformation requires structural changes and the participation of all organizational elements, while Hermila and Bau (2023) highlighted

technical obstacles to implementing e-learning due to limited digital skills among teachers. This suggests the need for a systematic approach to capacity and infrastructure development.

Furthermore, Nofridasari and Hidayati (2024) noted that digitalization challenges traditional teaching methods, forcing education to adapt. Yusuf et al. (2023) suggested implementing the Digital Education 5.0 concept as an innovative strategy to create interactive and contextual learning environments. Therefore, educational institutions require adaptive and collaborative human resource management strategies to effectively navigate the complexities of these changes.

The main problems in human resource management in the education sector are low system efficiency, lack of transparency in decision-making, and limited staff digital literacy. A common solution highlighted in the literature is modernizing human resource management systems through the implementation of digital technology. Lumapouw et al. (2024) emphasize the importance of information systems for improving the efficiency of personnel data management. However, as noted by Elmortada et al. (2019), only one-third of managers are satisfied with the current management system, indicating the need for a comprehensive, adaptive and socially responsible overhaul (Bovan et al., 2022).

One specific solution proposed is the implementation of a Human Resource Information System (HRIS). HRIS is a digital system that automates HR processes such as recruitment, training, payroll, and performance evaluation. Widyaputri and Wulansari (2023) stated that HRIS can reduce administrative burdens and increase staff focus on strategic tasks. Donan et al. (2023) also linked HRIS use to increased overall organizational effectiveness.

Various previous studies support the importance of HRIS in supporting strategic HR management. Fadhli (2020) and Rizal et al. (2020) underscore the role of HRIS in identifying training needs and formulating data-driven strategies. Frisdayanti (2019) adds that HRIS facilitates employee performance analysis, which supports evidence-based decisions. Furthermore, HRIS supports effective internal collaboration and communication, as noted by Mayasari et al. (2021) and Dewi et al. (2024).

The literature also highlights the successes and challenges of HRIS implementation in the education and public sectors. In the education sector, HRIS has been shown to improve discipline and work efficiency (Styawati & Gorda, 2020) and support strategic decision-making (Suharti & Sulisty, 2018). However, technology adoption and staff training remain low (Hosain et al., 2020; Abuhantash, 2023). In the public sector, HRIS supports innovation and service efficiency (Satispi et al., 2023; Alkhwalidi et al., 2022), but is hampered by cost, maintenance, and a lack of technical competency (Tursunbayeva et al., 2020; Dang et al., 2024). Panjaitan (2023) emphasizes the importance of training and management support as key solutions.

This study aims to examine the implementation of HRIS in human resource management in educational institutions by highlighting the benefits, challenges, and factors contributing to its success. The novelty of this study lies in its comprehensive approach in the context of educational institutions in developing countries, which is still rarely explored. The research hypothesis is that the success of HRIS implementation is greatly influenced by digital infrastructure readiness, staff competence, and managerial support. The scope of the study includes institutional readiness, system benefits, technical and cultural barriers, and the role of leadership. Therefore, the results of this study are expected to provide scientific and practical contributions to the development of HR management systems that are adaptive to the digital era.

## **METHOD**

This study uses a qualitative approach with a systematic literature review method to explore the implementation of Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) in HR management in the education sector. This method was chosen because it is effective in exploring phenomena conceptually and contextually through a review of various scientific literature, as suggested by Astuti et al. (2024). Data were collected systematically from secondary sources such as journals, proceedings, academic books, and relevant research reports, obtained from databases such as Google Scholar, ScienceDirect, SINTA, and DOAJ, with a focus on publications from the last ten years. Source triangulation techniques were

used to ensure data validity and reliability. Data analysis was conducted using content analysis techniques that include literature sorting, coding themes, developing narrative synthesis, and drawing conclusions, as demonstrated in previous studies. Data validity was strengthened through repeated reflection and transparent recording of sources, taking into account diverse perspectives. The choice of this methodology was based on its ability to answer research questions related to the effectiveness, challenges, and supporting factors of HRIS, as expressed by Purnawan et al. (2020) and Utami et al. (2024). The main limitations of this study are the lack of primary data and the limited resources available on HRIS in Indonesian education, but these are offset by the depth of analysis and diversity of references. Overall, this methodology provides a strong foundation for assessing the contribution of HRIS to technology-based HR management in the education sector.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study aims to explore and analyze the application of Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) in HR management in educational institutions. Based on an analysis of existing literature and observations of several case studies in educational institutions, several important findings were identified regarding HRIS implementation in educational HR management.

### **Digital Readiness of Educational Institutions in Adopting HRIS**

The digital readiness of educational institutions to adopt Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) is influenced by a combination of factors. One of the most dominant is support from top management. As noted by Ngai and Wat (2006), HRIS implementation failure is often caused by a lack of commitment from top management, especially in small organizations. This is confirmed by Tamrakar and Shrestha (2022), who highlight the critical role of management in providing resources and facilitating HRIS implementation.

On the other hand, psychological aspects such as perceptions of new systems also play a significant role. Anitha and Aruna (2015) found that users from small organizations often feel anxious about the complexity of new technologies, which affects adoption readiness. Technological aspects, as explained by Dang et al. (2024), include ease of use, reliability, and system integration capabilities. Good management practices, such as communication and change management, also contribute to the acceptance of new technologies.

Bensaid (2023) and Teo et al. (2007) emphasize the importance of training in empowering users to use HRIS effectively. Without adequate training, users tend to struggle with system adaptation. Organizational environmental factors and work culture also play a role. A study by Haleem and Ditsa (2024) showed that positive perceptions of HRIS benefits and an organizational culture supportive of technological innovation significantly contribute to successful adoption.

### **Human Resources Competence and Infrastructure Readiness**

The success of HRIS implementation depends heavily on the digital competence of staff and the readiness of the technology infrastructure. Mardani and Yudantara (2023) stated that HR competence significantly influences the quality of information systems. Nurhabibah (2023) added that digital competence also impacts the ability to innovate and work efficiency.

Infrastructure readiness is also crucial. Tampubolon (2022) emphasized that adequate technological infrastructure is a key requirement for information system implementation. Infrastructure includes networks, hardware, and other supporting systems that must be available to support HRIS. Shanti et al. (2024) emphasized that sound IT infrastructure and internal control systems contribute to report quality, demonstrating a strong correlation with HRIS system effectiveness.

### **Impact of HRIS on Efficiency and Decision Making**

HRIS significantly contributes to administrative efficiency and decision-making in educational institutions. A study at Tahfiz Darul Adib (Ibnutama et al., 2024) showed that the integration of academic and management systems accelerated administrative processes and improved academic oversight. Astuti et al. (2024) showed that information systems improved teacher and student performance monitoring and supported data-driven decision-making. Similar results were obtained by Wijaya and Risdiansyah (2020) in the context of academic

information systems. Furthermore, HRIS contributes to the development of inclusive education policies through systems such as EMIS, which support educational access for marginalized groups (Kurnia et al., 2024). HRIS also increases parental involvement in children's education, which has been shown to support better educational achievement (Astuti et al., 2024).

### **HRIS and Personnel Data Management**

The implementation of HRIS, particularly in the form of SIMPEG, increases transparency and accuracy in personnel data management. Wahid and Homaidi (2023) demonstrated that this system can significantly improve personnel management. Dumyati and Farisi (2025) developed a Rational Unified Process (RUP)-based system that increases data processing efficiency. Hao et al. (2024) added that a web-based employee information system can reduce data errors and support transparency, despite facing integration challenges with national databases. Gulo et al. (2025) and Ferdiansyah & Mardiani (2025) stated that HRIS systems improve information access and operational productivity. Taufan and Hidayat (2023) and Pilipus et al. (2024) also demonstrated similar benefits, particularly in terms of data security and efficiency.

### **Resistance to HRIS Implementation**

HRIS implementation is not without resistance, especially individual resistance. Lestari (2023) and Jambak et al. (2023) note that resistance arises from fear of change, lack of understanding, and perceived threats to the status quo.

Jambak et al. (2023) and Dirgantara et al. (2023) highlight the importance of communication in reducing resistance. Huda & Aslami (2024) show that employee involvement in HRIS planning can increase ownership. Irrelevant training exacerbates resistance (Lamirin et al., 2023). Therefore, a change management strategy that includes open communication, relevant training, and management support is necessary (Nazmah, 2022; Duman et al., 2021; Umar & Widodo, 2022).

### **Strategies to Overcome Technical and Cost Barriers**

To overcome barriers to HRIS implementation, key strategies include technical training, cost management, and infrastructure evaluation. Ariani (2023) and Amin et al. (2021) emphasize the importance of technical training for all stakeholders.

Judijanto et al. (2024) suggest a phased implementation approach to manage costs efficiently. Triwiyanto et al. (2024) also show that good resource management supports system effectiveness. Pradnyana et al. (2024) and Dewangga et al. (2022) emphasize the need for a comprehensive infrastructure evaluation to ensure technology readiness before HRIS adoption.

### **The Role of Transformational Leadership**

Transformational leadership contributes to successful HRIS adoption. Alós-Simó et al. (2017) and Troshani et al. (2011) emphasize the importance of leaders as change agents who drive innovation and employee engagement.

Chen et al. (2012) demonstrated that transformational leadership impacts technological innovation through its influence on an innovative culture. Elmasry & Bakri (2019) and Le & Lei (2019) emphasized the importance of employee motivation and engagement in the adoption of new technologies. Jun & Lee (2023) emphasized that commitment to change and employee engagement are highly determined by transformational leadership style.

### **Digital Management and Culture Commitment**

Management commitment is the foundation for creating a digital culture that supports HRIS success. Faizal (2024) and Putro (2024) emphasize that HR management must act as an agent of strategic change. The effectiveness of a management system depends on a commitment to developing open communication and an effective feedback system (Sebayang & Fitriyah, 2024; Hasanah & Supriyanto, 2023).

Commitment is also evident in management participation in training and development, as well as clear communication of the organization's vision (Putri et al., 2022; Zahari et al., 2022). This creates a sense of ownership among employees, which is crucial for supporting sustainable digital transformation. Overall, management commitment is a key driver of successful HRIS implementation in educational institutions by fostering a digital culture that supports innovation and collaboration.

## DISCUSSION

The implementation of Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) in educational institutions is a strategic step to strengthen the human resource (HR) management system, which ultimately improves the overall quality of educational services. HRIS is an important tool for managing, analyzing, and organizing HR data systematically and efficiently (BONITA, 2020). By using HRIS, HR administration processes such as recruitment, training, and performance evaluation can be carried out in a more structured and accurate manner (Gumulya & Suhendi, 2019). In practice, the use of systems such as OrangeHRM has been proven to simplify HR work, accelerate data processing, and improve operational efficiency (Gumulya & Suhendi, 2019).

Effective human resource management directly contributes to improving the quality of education. Previous research confirms that an institution's ability to manage human resources effectively impacts the quality of learning outcomes and overall academic performance (NURHASANAH et al., 2024). The availability of accurate data through HRIS facilitates leadership in evaluating and developing data-driven human resource development strategies, as stated by Susanto et al. (2024). In this context, leadership that supports collaboration and builds an inclusive organizational culture is crucial (Faizal, 2024).

The positive impact of HRIS on efficiency and decision-making has been observed in various studies. HRIS improves oversight of teacher and administrative staff performance (HS et al., 2024) and impacts employee job satisfaction and motivation, which ultimately impacts student achievement (Sulistiyani & Aryanto, 2024). This demonstrates that HRIS is not only an administrative tool but also serves as a driver for improving educational quality and institutional reputation (Alhabsyi et al., 2023).

However, despite its benefits, HRIS implementation faces various challenges. Support from top management is essential for optimal HRIS performance (Ngai & Wat, 2006; Tamrakar & Shrestha, 2022). Lack of this support can lead to system failure and employee resistance. Furthermore, technological readiness and staff digital competency are key factors. Without sufficient understanding and skills, staff tend to show resistance to new technologies (Anitha & Aruna, 2015).

Staff digital competence and infrastructure readiness are two crucial aspects that must be developed simultaneously. Research by Mardani & Yudiantara (2023) shows that staff digital competence is directly proportional to the accuracy and effectiveness of information system reports. Nurhabibah (2023) adds that this competence also enhances staff innovation. Furthermore, technological infrastructure readiness is the foundation of all HRIS implementation processes (Tampubolon, 2022). Lack of infrastructure hinders access and slows down the technology integration process.

Amid these challenges, training strategies are crucial. As explained by Bensaid (2023), comprehensive training empowers users to operate the system. However, resistance to training can also arise if its benefits are not communicated well (Lestari, 2023). Therefore, employee involvement in the training planning and implementation process is a crucial strategy for creating a sense of ownership and reducing resistance (Jambak et al., 2023; Lamirin et al., 2023). In the long term, continuing education must become an integral part of the educational institution's culture, both through the curriculum and external partnerships (Khoirunnisa & Firmansyah, 2024).

In addition to training, HRIS implementation cost management is crucial. A phased implementation strategy allows for more effective budget management (Judijanto et al., 2024). Budget adjustments and infrastructure evaluations prior to implementation, as

Furthermore, HRIS success is highly dependent on leadership style. Transformational leadership has been shown to foster a culture of innovation and employee engagement (Alós-Simó et al., 2017; Troshani et al., 2011). Inspiring and visionary leaders tend to encourage employees to actively participate in the process of change and technology adoption (Chen et al., 2012; Le & Lei, 2019). Managerial support not only facilitates technology transitions but also acts as a change agent capable of building a shared vision and fostering open and effective communication (Faizal, 2024; Hidayanto et al., 2012).

Failure to adopt digital transformation, particularly HRIS, can lead to a decline in the overall quality of education. Matriano (2023) and Alenezi et al. (2023) warn that graduates from institutions that fail to adapt to digital transformation will struggle to compete in the job market. Furthermore, institutions that resist digital transformation risk losing relevance among prospective students and will face challenges in maintaining operational sustainability (Ghufron & Mardiana, 2023).

From a human resources perspective, resistance to technology reduces the motivation and engagement of teaching staff and hinders innovative learning processes (Saragih et al., 2023; Sismanto et al., 2024). In the long term, institutions that are unresponsive to technological change will face difficulties in responding to crises or sudden changes such as pandemics (Pu et al., 2022).

Considering these various dimensions, it is clear that HRIS is a strategic instrument for strengthening human resource management and improving educational quality. However, its success requires comprehensive support from management, technology, human resources, and organizational culture. Therefore, educational institutions must view HRIS not merely as an administrative tool, but as an integral part of institutional transformation oriented toward innovation and excellence in educational services in the digital age.

## CONCLUSION

This study highlights the importance of digital readiness, human resource competency, and managerial support in the successful implementation of Human Resource Information Systems (HRIS) in the education sector. Findings indicate that a combination of technological, psychological, organizational, and transformational leadership factors plays a key role in ensuring that HRIS systems are not only implemented but also contribute to improving the quality of educational services and the efficiency of human resource management. The study's primary contribution lies in integrating managerial, technical, and social perspectives to understand the dynamics of HRIS implementation in educational institutions. This study enriches the literature by highlighting a holistic approach to digital transformation in education and offers practical insights for policymakers and institutional management. Future research is recommended to explore the evaluation of the long-term impact of HRIS implementation through longitudinal studies and primary data-driven approaches.

## REFERENCES

- Abroor, A. & Mulyati, S. (2024). Development of an administrative information system and learning activity plan for Darussalam Plus Kindergarten. *JITSI Scientific Journal of Information Systems Technology*, 5(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.30630/jitsi.5.1.203>
- Alam, M., Masum, A., Beh, L., & Hong, C. (2016). Critical factors influencing the decision to adopt human resource information system (HRIS) in hospitals. *PLOS ONE*, 11(8), e0160366. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0160366>
- Alenezi, M., Wardat, S., & Akour, M. (2023). The need for integrating digital education in higher education: Challenges and opportunities. *Sustainability*, 15(6), 4782. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su15064782>
- Amin, M., Setyonugroho, W., & Hidayah, N. (2021). Implementation of electronic medical records: a qualitative study. *JATISI*, 8(1), 430–442. <https://doi.org/10.35957/jatisi.v8i1.557>
- Anitha, J. & Aruna, M. (2015). Transformation towards human resource information systems. *Journal of Management and Development Studies*, 26, 30–50. <https://doi.org/10.3126/jmds.v26i0.24940>

- Astuti, N., Mawardi, A., Ramadhani, M., & Fitriani, N. (2024). The positive impact of educational management information systems. *Pahlawan Jurnal Pendidikan-Sosial-Budaya*, 20(2), 375–380. <https://doi.org/10.57216/pah.v20i2.853>
- Bensaid, M. (2023). Antecedents of human resource information system adoption: A qualitative study in French context. *Journal of Digitalization and Information Systems*, 3(1), 16–31. <https://doi.org/10.54433/jdiis.2023100019>
- Dang, H., Kieu, H., & Bui, T. (2024). Factors influencing users' retention of using human resources information system. *IJMRGE*, 5(2), 838–846. <https://doi.org/10.54660/ijmrge.2024.5.2.838-846>
- Donan, H., Negara, E., Sutabri, T., & Firdaus, F. (2023). Analysis of behavioral use of academic information systems. *Jurnal Sisfokom*, 12(3), 462–470. <https://doi.org/10.32736/sisfokom.v12i3.1978>
- Dumyati, A. & Farisi, A. (2025). Application of the RUP method in developing personnel systems. *MDP-SC*, 4(1), 547–555. <https://doi.org/10.35957/mdp-sc.v4i1.11297>
- Elmortada, A., Mokhlis, C., Mokhlis, A., & Elfezazi, S. (2019). Assessment of managers satisfaction regarding the HR function. *PEN*, 7(2), 924. <https://doi.org/10.21533/pen.v6i2.588>
- Fadhli, M. (2020). Implementation of strategic management in educational institutions. *Continuous Education Journal of Science and Research*, 1(1), 11–23. <https://doi.org/10.51178/ce.v1i1.7>
- Fridayanti, A. (2019). The role of brainware in management information systems. *Journal of Information Systems Management Economics*, 1(1), 60–69. <https://doi.org/10.31933/jemsi.v1i1.47>
- Gani, N., Suprayitno, D., Wardhani, D., Imran, H., & Rahwana, K. (2024). Optimizing HRIS in MSME technology management. *Journal of Information and Technology*, 302–309. <https://doi.org/10.60083/jidt.v6i1.519>
- Gumulya, E. & Suhendi, S. (2019). Implementation of HR recruitment information system at PT XYZ using OrangeHRM. *Integrated Informatics Journal*, 5(2), 65–70. <https://doi.org/10.54914/jit.v5i2.203>
- Hakim, A. (2023). The concept of human resource management towards people's welfare in the era of digital challenges. *Journal of Economics and Business UBS*, 12(4), 2672–2682. <https://doi.org/10.52644/joeb.v12i4.467>
- Hasrianti, H. & Hidayati, D. (2023). Efforts to develop private high school teachers in Kendari City. *Edukatif*, 5(2), 1494–1507. <https://doi.org/10.31004/edukatif.v5i2.5218>
- Hermila, A. & Bau, R. (2023). E-learning as a complement to learning. *Journal of Public Policy Studies*, 2(1), 69–79. <https://doi.org/10.21787/jskp.2.2023.69-79>
- Hs, M., Us, K., & Shalahudin, S. (2024). Human resource management in education. *Leader Journal of Islamic Education Management*, 2(1), 207–217. <https://doi.org/10.32939/ljmpi.v2i1.4047>
- Kumar, N. & Parumasur, S. (2013). The impact of HRIS on organizational efficiency. *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 11(1), 567–575. <https://doi.org/10.22495/cocv11i1c6art4>
- Lumapouw, H., Rotty, V., & Sumual, T. (2024). An innovative conceptual model for HRM in educational institutions. *International Journal of Social Services and Research*, 4(10). <https://doi.org/10.46799/ijssr.v4i10.1078>
- Mayasari, A., Supriani, Y., & Arifudin, O. (2021). Implementation of academic management information systems. *JiIP*, 4(5), 340–345. <https://doi.org/10.54371/jiip.v4i5.277>
- Ngai, E. & Wat, F. (2006). HRIS: A review and empirical analysis. *Personnel Review*, 35(3), 297–314. <https://doi.org/10.1108/00483480610656702>
- Nofridasari, E. & Hidayati, D. (2024). Digital transformation and strengthening Pancasila character. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 14(2), 30–36. <https://doi.org/10.21009/jpd.v14i2.38890>
- Rizal, S., Hasan, I., Abdullah, I., & Anismayanti, A. (2020). The influence of education, training, and work performance assessment. *Bridge of Management Scientific Journal*, 17(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.29259/jmbt.v17i1.10805>
- Rusiyati, S., Mulyadi, H., Elyana, I., Givan, B., Hidayah, A., & Fauzi, S. (2023). Human resource management training in the digital era. *Jurnal Abdimas Nusa Mandiri*, 5(1), 8–

14. <https://doi.org/10.33480/abdimas.v5i1.4136>
- Styawati, K. & Gorda, A. (2020). Implementation of HRIS in the Industrial Revolution 4.0. *JBHOST*, 6(2), 367. <https://doi.org/10.22334/jbhost.v6i2.219>
- Suharti, L. & Sulisty, P. (2018). The implementation of HRIS and its benefits for organizations. *Diponegoro International Journal of Business*, 1(1), 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.14710/dijb.1.1.2018.1-7>
- Tursunbayeva, A., Bunduchi, R., & Pagliari, C. (2020). "Planned benefits" can be misleading in digital transformation. *SAGE Open*, 10(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020933881>
- Widyaputri, S. & Wulansari, P. (2023). Human resource management practices and employee competencies. *JOMB*, 5(2), 1195-1202. <https://doi.org/10.31539/jomb.v5i2.6396>
- Yusuf, M., Julianingsih, D., & Ramadhani, T. (2023). Digital education transformation 5.0. *Mentari Journal of Educational Management and Information Technology*, 2(1), 11-19. <https://doi.org/10.33050/mentari.v2i1.328>
- Zulfa, A., Therasari, A., Syahrudin, E., et al. (2024). Digital transformation in the service of making incoming transfer letters. *Karimahtauhid*, 3(2), 1724-1735. <https://doi.org/10.30997/karimahtauhid.v3i2.11906>